

Down the foggy ruins of time:

Bob Dylan and the concept of evidence

No edition of *Teaching History* devoted to creativity could be complete without returning to the riches that popular songs offer to historians and history teachers alike. The five Bob Dylan songs that Christopher Edwards explores here are chosen not merely for their 'literary qualities' and 'emotional charge'; they also provide a powerful commentary on the US Civil Rights Movement of the early 1960s and were – arguably, at least – integral to the tumultuous events of that period. While fully recognising their creative power and capacity to capture students' interest, Edwards' greatest concern is to exploit their potential as evidence. More specifically, building on the understanding that Lee and Shemilt's research has given us of students' misconceptions about the use of sources (*TH* 113), Edwards sets out to explore how compelling collections of this kind can be used quite deliberately to help students develop more powerful ways of thinking about our knowledge of the past.

Christopher Edwards

Christopher Edwards is a tutor on the Graduate Teaching Programme at the Institute of Education, London

An interest in the potential of song as a source of evidence in the history classroom has burgeoned recently. Mastin, Butler, Sweerts and Grice all make the point that songs possess a power to engage and draw students into the study of history.¹ Few would disagree that songs make excellent initial stimulus material and most of us, at one time or another, have employed song in this way. For me, however, the real significance of that selection of previous *Teaching History* articles is their suggestion that song can deliver much more than this. Songs can, they propose, be incorporated into the processes of historical enquiry and play a role in developing students' historical thinking. Songs can in fact be used to develop students' conceptual understanding of history.

With this aim in mind, I look in this article at five songs composed by Bob Dylan during the period 1962–3, all dealing with race relations and the Civil Rights Movement in the USA. The song *The Murder Emmett Till* was written in February 1962; *Blowin' in the Wind* in April 1962; *Only a Pawn in Their Game* in July 1963; *The Lonesome Death of Hattie Carroll* in September 1963; and *The Times They Are A-Changin'* in October 1963. In each case Dylan wrote these songs as a direct response to contemporary events.²

For teachers with an interest in the Civil Rights Movement during the early 1960s there are good reasons to consider these songs for the classroom. *Emmett Till*, *Only a Pawn in Their Game* and *Hattie Carroll* provide commentaries on major civil rights events, while the anthemic *Blowin' in the Wind* and *The Times They Are A-Changin'* were integral to the events themselves. Treated as historical sources of evidence these songs possess striking literary qualities and carry an emotional charge that conveys layered meanings.

The focus in this article is upon classroom activities that employ the songs to develop students' understanding of a concept of evidence.³ The activities outlined here are certainly not intended to be read as a scheme of work to be followed sequentially but as food for thought to assist in the planning of teachers' own schemes of work and with the development of their own approaches to working with historical sources. The framing of the activities draws upon the research of Ashby, Lee, Shemilt and Wineburg.⁴ This body of work, more so than any other, I think, challenges us to think anew about working with historical sources. Taking classroom practice that at times treats source-work as a repertoire of techniques (skills and processes), they extend the remit to include exposing and then challenging students' ideas about the role that sources as evidence play in the construction of historical knowledge. In this approach working with sources integrates knowledge of what happened in the past with an understanding of how we know: a reflective approach that addresses the epistemological question 'What is the status of historical knowledge?' If we are to make headway in this direction, I argue, we require classroom activities that allow students to think historically with sources and about sources.⁵

Fixed-story thinking

Finding out what your students already think about the role that sources play in the construction of historical knowledge is a recommended first step when working with song as evidence. It involves open discussion and careful listening on the part of the teacher. Research suggests that students commonly struggle with the vital distinction between the past (events that have occurred) and history (accounts about past events written

Figure 1: Activity one – Challenging ‘copy and paste’ history



by historians). For many students the past is thought to be a single unchanging story and learning history an activity of remembering the main facts. For such students, a study of the Civil Rights Movement in the USA during the early 1960s means being able to recall the main points in the story of what happened.

Sources as evidence do not feature strongly in fixed story thinking because the story is sufficient unto itself: there are no new discoveries to be made. If your students are thinking in this way then asking them to listen to a song such as *Blowin’ in the Wind* may well elicit the response ‘What has this got to do with history?’ Or, presented to them as a stand-alone source, the song may be thought of as factual information to

be accepted at face value, an illustration of the story. Or, they may regard the song as witness testimony from the past – as either true or false, to be accepted or rejected. As Lee and Wineburg’s work suggests, the idea that a song is historical evidence demanding critical interrogation is not one that comes naturally or readily to students.⁶

Activity one: challenging ‘copy and paste’ history

A feature of fixed-story thinking is that history, the record of the past, is regarded as a body of authoritative knowledge: the past is known and is to be found in secondary sources; or you, their teacher – since you have, after all, been to university



Biography

Bob Dylan was born in the northern state of Minnesota in 1941. His parents were reasonably well-off Jewish immigrants. In 1961, aged 20, he disrupted his university education to embark on a musical career. He moved to New York and while there fell in with a radical left-wing community of writers and performers. In 1962 he began his association with the Civil Rights Movement singing at benefit concerts. In the summer of 1963 he encountered, for the first time, Jim Crow segregation when singing in a civil rights concert in Mississippi. In August 1963 he sang two 'protest songs' at the March on Washington.

As the five songs in this collection were written between 1962 and 1963, it can be suggested that Dylan was responding to civil rights events as they unfolded. They were written, in part, to challenge racist attitudes and to rally support for the Civil Rights Movement. During this period the media proclaimed Dylan to be the 'spokesman of his generation'. This was a title he strongly resisted when he began to distance himself from the Movement in 1964.

Questions

- 1** *In the light of Dylan's biography are there reasons for thinking he would make a valuable witness of the Civil Rights Movement?*
- 2** *Dylan wrote a number of songs about the Civil Rights Movement. Do you think they are likely to be trustworthy or untrustworthy?*
- 3** *In his songs Dylan expresses his thoughts, feelings and attitudes about race relations and the Civil Rights Movement. Do you think that Dylan's thoughts and feelings can tell us anything about the past?*

Importantly, the responses students give to these questions will expose much about their prior understanding of their concept of evidence. While our eventual aim is that students should reject the premise underpinning question 2 – that a source in itself can simply be classed as 'trustworthy' or 'untrustworthy' – their answers at this stage allow us to see how they currently conceive of sources as evidence. Once their unhelpful assumptions have been elicited they are much easier to probe and to challenge in carefully structured ways.

– will be able to tell your students exactly what happened. For many students web sources have authoritative status. They contain 'true' knowledge and confirm that history is an uncomplicated single story. We have all experienced that sinking feeling at the sight of printed web pages handed in as an independent research assignment with the student's name on the front, proudly declaring it to be their own. Then follows your surprise at the student's incomprehension as you struggle to explain that this is not what you actually meant by historical research. The first activity, presented in Figure 1, challenges fixed-story thinking or 'copy and paste' history – the understanding that historical knowledge is to

be found at the press of a key and must be true because the computer said so.

In this activity the song *Only a Pawn in Their Game* is played to challenge students' thinking that a history website warrants the status of authoritative knowledge, representing a single fixed story of the Civil Rights Movement. With a concern for the underlying political, social and economic causes of racial discrimination and violence in the Southern States, *Only a Pawn in Their Game* introduces dissonance between two versions of the past: song and web account. In this song Dylan provides us with an analysis of southern

A checklist of attitudes is used to explore the underlying attitudes and values contained in the songs.

- ➔ Questioning
- ➔ Analytical
- ➔ Outraged
- ➔ Angry
- ➔ Optimistic

Question: What subjective attitudes does Dylan convey in these songs?



working-class racism. In verse four, for example, the focus is upon poverty as cause:

*From the poverty shacks, he looks from the
cracks to the tracks
And the hoof beats pound in his brain
And he's taught how to walk in a pack
Shoot in the back
With his fist in a clinch
To hang and to lynch
To hide 'neath the hood
To kill with no pain
Like a dog on a chain
He ain't got no name
But it ain't him to blame*

Juxtaposing these two sources challenges the view that the study of history is a single fixed story and opens a door to discussing with students the nature of accounts and the distinction between the past and history.

Testimony thinking

Another strategy to challenge students' fixed-story thinking is to introduce aspects of Dylan's biography (see Figure 2). This is a strategy that alters a song's status from that of factual information to be accepted at face value, to that of testimony requiring interrogation. In summary, Dylan, in 1962, was a young musician living in the northern city of New York. He was white, Jewish, middle class and 'liberal'. Between 1962 and 1963 he supported the Civil Rights Movement by

playing at both a Congress of Racial Equality (CORE) and a Student Nonviolent Coordinating Committee (SNCC) benefit concert and in August 1963 he performed at the March on Washington for Freedom and Jobs.

With accompanying biographical information the songs are no longer simply 'out there'. Biography insists that someone wrote the songs with purpose at a particular time and place. Authoring the songs invites class discussion on questions of source production, perspective, motive, utility, reliability and value. Bringing to bear Dylan's gender, age, social class, ethnicity, and political viewpoint facilitates a *critical* reading.

A song does not have to be truthful to be useful

The third activity (Figure 3) engages with students' understanding of bias – specifically the ways in which their assumptions about it often prevent them from appreciating the full value of subjective elements in historical sources. The research suggests that students are dismissive of subjective values in sources, treating them in a blanket way as 'biased' which is taken to mean untruthful and therefore useless.⁸ In working with the subtext of the songs – their underlying values – class discussion can centre on how Dylan's attitudes and feelings are in themselves evidence about aspects of the Civil Rights era. We shall discuss them here in general terms by way of an introduction to those unfamiliar with Dylan's work. It must be borne in mind, however, that these songs resist a single reading.

Emmett Till expresses outrage at the nature of the murder of Till and the injustice of the court case of his two murderers.

A newspaper report from *Time* magazine, 6 September 1963



Early this year, William Devereux Zantzinger, 24, a prosperous tobacco farmer in southern Maryland, went on a bender with his wife, ended the evening charged with homicide (TIME, Feb. 22). At a restaurant, Zantzinger whacked two employees with a cane. Later that evening, at a white-tie dance in a Baltimore hotel, he used the cane again on a Negro bellhop and a Negro waitress. Then he scolded a Negro barmaid, Mrs. Hattie Carroll, 51. "What's the matter with you, you black son of a bitch," he snarled, "serving my drinks so slow?" With that, he beat the woman with his cane. She collapsed and was taken off in an ambulance. Eight hours later Mrs. Carroll, mother of eleven

children, died of a brain hemorrhage. She had had high blood pressure and an enlarged heart.

In June, after Zantzinger's phalanx of five topflight attorneys won a change of venue to a court in Hagerstown, a three-judge panel reduced the murder charge to manslaughter. Following a three-day trial, Zantzinger was found guilty.

Last week the judges announced sentence. For the assault on the hotel employees: a fine of \$125. For the death of Hattie Carroll: six months in jail and a fine of \$500. The judges considerably deferred the start of the jail sentence until Sept. 15, to give Zantzinger time to harvest his tobacco crop.¹²

Question: Use the song and the newspaper report to write an account of the murder of Hattie Carroll

In the final verse, Dylan concludes with an appeal to social patriotism:

*If you can't speak out against this kind of thing, a crime
that's so unjust,*

*Your eyes are filled with dead men's dirt, your mind is
filled with dust.*

*Your arms and legs they must be in shackles and chains,
and your blood it must refuse to flow,*

*For you let this human race fall down so God-awful
low!*

*This song is just a reminder to remind your fellow man
That this kind of thing still lives today in that ghost-
robed Ku Klux Klan.*

*But if all of us folks that thinks alike, if we gave all we
could give,*

*We could make this great land of ours a greater place
to live.*

In *Blowin' in The Wind*, Dylan's attitude is questioning. In this song the prospect of progressive change appears remote and the tone is sombre – posing many questions, he offers few answers:

*How many roads must a man walk down
Before you call him a man?*

*Yes, 'n' how many deaths will it take till he knows
That too many people have died?*

*Yes, 'n' how many times can a man turn his head,
Pretending he just doesn't see?*

*Yes, 'n' how many years can some people exist
Before they're allowed to be free?*

In *The Lonesome Death of Hattie Carroll*, Dylan's focus is again upon the injustice of a legal system that awards a six-month sentence for a racially motivated murder. He contrasts the privileged lifestyle of the white murderer with that of Hattie Carroll and throughout the tone is one of anger and shame:

*Hattie Carroll was a maid of the kitchen.
She was fifty-one years old and gave birth to ten
children*

*Who carried the dishes and took out the garbage
And never sat once at the head of the table
And didn't even talk to the people at the table
Who just cleaned up all the food from the table
And emptied the ashtrays on a whole other level,
Got killed by a blow, lay slain by a cane*

*That sailed through the air and came down through
the room,*

*Doomed and determined to destroy all the gentle.
And she never done nothing to William Zantzinger.*

*But you who philosophize disgrace and criticize all
fears,*

Take the rag away from your face.

Now ain't the time for your tears.

The subject of *Only a Pawn in Their Game* is the murder on the 12th of June 1963 of Medgar Evers, a leading member of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), outside his home in Jackson Mississippi. Dylan's response is an analysis of the underlying causes for the murder, which he suggests are structural rather than individual. The main cause for the murder, he argues, is to be found in a culture of racism – the assassin was a product of the Southern social system. In verse two Dylan analyses the politics of racism:

*A South politician preaches to the poor white man
 "You got more than blacks, don't complain
 You're better than them, you been born with white skin"
 they explain
 And the Negro's name
 Is used it is plain
 For the politician's gain
 As he rises to fame
 And the poor white remains
 On the caboose of the train
 But it ain't him to blame
 He's only a pawn in their game.*

The Times They Are A-Changin' strikes a stridently optimistic note. This rallying cry suggests that progressive reform is imminent and is in the hands of the younger generation.

*Come mothers and fathers
 Throughout the land
 And don't criticize
 What you can't understand
 Your sons and your daughters
 Are beyond your command
 Your old road is
 Rapidly agin'.
 Please get out of the new one
 If you can't lend your hand
 For the times they are a-changin'.*

The songs, *Emmett Till*, *Hattie Carroll* and *Only a Pawn in Their Game* share the theme of race relations in the Southern States and in particular the question of white racial violence. They form a source-base for an enquiry into the Southern white backlash during the late 1950s and the early 1960s. *Emmett Till* explores the brutality of the South, citing the Ku Klux Klan and a corrupt legal system. In *Hattie Carroll* the wealth and privilege of the Southern white elite is contrasted with the poverty and powerlessness of African Americans, while *Only a Pawn in Their Game* is focused on the social and political system that underlies and supports southern racism.

In the media Dylan has frequently been referred to as a 'spokesperson' or 'the voice of his generation'. A recent biography of Dylan by Jeremy Roberts, for example, is entitled *Bob Dylan: Voice of a generation*.⁹ For the history teacher this is a claim that can be subjected to classroom scrutiny. Can Dylan's songs be used to gauge broader shifts in social attitudes? Do songs like *Hattie Carroll* and *Pawn in Their Game* mirror attitudes held widely in the USA? Here caution is required; for, as Mike Marqusee points out:

Figure 5: Activity six – Thinking evidentially

Three enquiries are set which employ some or all of the five songs.

Organise the class into small groups each of which is assigned one of three enquiry questions.

- A** *What was the condition of race relations in the USA during the early 1960s?*
- B** *What were the underlying reasons for racially-motivated violence during this period?*
- C** *What solutions were offered during this period to tackle the problems of race relations?*

As a guide for teachers, the songs *Emmett Till*, *Only a Pawn in Their Game* and *Hattie Carroll* mainly inform enquiry questions A and B, while *Blowin in the Wind* and *The Times They are A-Changin* mainly inform enquiry question C. When the groups have presented their findings the class share the pool of collective findings to write accounts of race relations and the Civil Rights Movement.

*In the years during which Dylan wrote these protest songs, the overwhelming majority of white American youth subscribed to opinions that ranged only within the narrow band between deeply conservative and cautiously liberal. The politics he embraced in these songs were fashionable only among a small minority.*¹⁰

Challenging fixed-story thinking using two accounts

Comparing Dylan's representation of the murder of Hattie Carroll with a second account is the focus of the next activity (see Figure 4). When comparing two different accounts or sources, there is a tendency for students, particularly those who consider history to be a fixed story, to think that only one can be 'correct'. Developing a concept of evidence challenges right/wrong thinking by finding value across sources.

When writing *The Lonesome Death of Hattie Carroll*, Dylan drew upon a contemporary newspaper report. Dylan explained, 'I felt I had a lot in common with this situation and was able to manifest my feelings'.¹¹ In his song Dylan portrays Zantzinger as the spoilt child of inherited wealth and privilege, an unfeeling, arrogant

Figure 6: Activity seven – Extending the enquiry

Verse three of Bob Dylan's *Blowin' in the Wind*

How many years can a mountain exist
Before it's washed to the sea?
Yes, 'n' how many years can some people
exist
Before they're allowed to be free?
Yes, 'n' how many times can a man turn
his head,
Pretending he just doesn't see?
The answer, my friend, is blowin' in the
wind,
The answer is blowin' in the wind.

Verse three of Sam Cooke's *A Change is Gonna Come*

I go to the movies, and I go downtown
Somebody keep telling me "Don't hang
around"
Its been a long time coming
But I know a change is gonna come
Then I go to my brother and I say "Brother,
help me please"
But he winds up knocking me back down
on my knees.¹⁴

Question: What do these two songs tell us about what it was like to live in America during the early 1960s?

racist 'who killed for no reason' and who 'just happened to be feelin' that way without warnin'. In this account:

*William Zanzinger killed poor Hattie Carroll
With a cane that he twirled around his diamond ring
finger
At a Baltimore hotel society gath'rin'.
And the cops were called in and his weapon took from
him
As they rode him in custody down to the station
And booked William Zanzinger for first-degree murder.*

*William Zanzinger, who at twenty-four years
Owns a tobacco farm of six hundred acres
With rich wealthy parents who provide and protect him
And high office relations in the politics of Maryland,
Reacted to his deed with a shrug of his shoulders*

*And swear words and sneering, and his tongue it was
snarling,
In a matter of minutes on bail was out walking.*

Presenting students with a second account in the form of a newspaper report, (the one used here is *not*, however, the one that Dylan actually used), provides students with an opportunity to consider what we have called the 'right/wrong' response to multiple sources. Do your students think that the newspaper report is more accurate, the 'best one' of the two? One way of challenging this assumption is to discuss how both sources provide valuable information about the murder; how neither source is without problems, and how they both raise important questions about what happened. Students can reflect that both the song and the report have utility.

Raising the bar with a single enquiry

If I were asked to recommend just one of the songs from the five to use with a Key Stage 3 class it would be *Emmett Till*. This terse, passionate rendering of events will not fail, I think, to engage a class. In the fifth activity, the song *Emmett Till* is used to develop the concept of evidence through historical enquiry. The question framing this enquiry is: 'Why was the murder of Emmett Till historically significant?'

In addressing this question it is important to know that Dylan composed the song *The Murder of Emmett Till* for a CORE benefit concert in February 1962, seven years after the 14-year-old Chicago-based Emmett was brutally murdered on August 28th 1955 while on a visit to Money, Mississippi. The gap of seven years between event and song composition is relevant: it signals the enduring impact the event had upon Dylan. Why was this so? Dylan was born in the same year as Emmett and was himself 14 years of age in 1955. Racially-motivated murder was not an uncommon occurrence in the South during the 1950s, so what were the characteristics of the Till case that made it leave such a deep and lasting impression? The song provides some clues as a starting point. Firstly, it is important to Dylan that Emmett is so young, and that he is from the North visiting the South. The song tells us that it was 'not so long ago' and that 'This boy's dreadful tragedy I can still remember well'.

*When a young boy from Chicago town stepped through
a Southern door.*

Dylan is struck by the senseless brutality of the murder, it:

*Was just for the fun of killin' him and to watch him
slowly die.*

And that the trial is a sham and few people are prepared to speak out:

*And so this trial was a mockery, but nobody seemed
to mind.*

Approaching a question such as this raises the bar in developing a concept of evidence. Asking why the murder of Emmett Till endured in collective memory to emerge during the early 1960s while other racially-motivated murders slipped by hardly noticed is a complex question. It requires

a sophisticated understanding on the part of students, that they can, through the study of historical sources, as Peter Lee suggests, 'construct a picture of the past by inference'.¹³

Inferential thinking, the realisation that songs can answer historical questions that they were not intended to answer, is further developed in the next activity.

Thinking evidentially

So far we have we have discussed the importance of engaging with students' fixed-story thinking about evidence and history. We have discussed the development of a concept of evidence in terms of a progression from thinking about history as a single story to thinking about history as constructed accounts based upon evidence. For those working with an under-developed concept of evidence, songs would simply illustrate the single story of civil rights providing ambient background interest. Working with a more developed concept of evidence, songs would be thought of as sources to support historical enquiries or investigations about the Civil Rights movement. Students would develop an understanding that the songs provided evidence for answering enquiry questions about the civil rights era.

The sixth activity involves multiple enquiries, conducted by small groups as a way of developing more sophisticated evidential thinking (see Figure 6). In this activity all of the songs are played to a class divided into small groups. After each song is played, thinking time is allowed for each group to discuss, note and feedback how the song informs their particular enquiry question. The activity demonstrates that a song can provide evidence for more than one enquiry question and that the value of a song as evidence depends upon the nature of the question which is being investigated.

Extending the enquiry

The work of Sam Cooke is an intriguing choice to extend the enquiry (see Figure 6). Cooke, a black American soul singer, wrote his own highly-acclaimed civil rights song *A Change is Gonna Come* in 1963 after hearing Dylan's *Blowin' in the Wind*. Importantly, Cooke wrote his song shortly after having been refused registration to a 'whites only' hotel. Further, the record company edited out verse three when the song was first released as a single in 1964, deeming it to be too inflammatory.

Unlike Dylan, Cooke experienced segregation at first hand. Written in the first person, the song tells us that he was born 'by a river in a little tent' and that his life has been 'too hard living' and throughout he has been 'running'. Yet despite deprivations, his mood (in 1963) remains optimistic for 'a change is gonna come'.

Conclusion

It has been suggested here that only by having a developed concept of evidence can our students begin to understand that songs like Dylan's are historical representations conveying meanings about the past. History textbooks during the early twentieth century routinely included selections of historical poetry for recitation. During this period, students were confronted with historical representations in verse form by

Shakespeare, William Cooper, Sir Walter Scott, Macaulay, Thomas Campbell, Tennyson and Henry Wadsworth Longfellow. Verse during this period favoured patriotism and valorised fallen heroes.¹⁵ As far as we can tell, the study of history in schools during the first half of the twentieth century was not overly concerned with the development of evidence as a concept. Instead, historical verse during this period was valued for its illustrative and emotional appeal to stimulate curiosity and forge attachment to a single fixed story.¹⁶

During the second half of the twentieth century the teaching of school history has become alive to the value of historical sources to promote enquiry and challenge fixed-story thinking. As historical sources, the songs of Bob Dylan offer historical learning considerably more than the 'initial stimulus' that they may often be used to supply. Incorporated into historical enquiries and regarded as critical objects, they possess qualities that can illuminate passages of the past and develop rigorous historical thinking. Songs as subtle as these raise questions about substantive knowledge and second-order concepts; they open up history to critical investigation and resist closure. Through studying these songs students are made aware that learning history is at its best an activity of enquiry.

REFERENCES

- 1 Mastin, S. (2002) "'Now listen to source A": music and history' in *Teaching History*, 108, *Performing History Edition*. Butler, S. (2003) "'What's that stuff you're listening to Sir?'" Rock and pop music as a rich source for historical enquiry', in *Teaching History*, 111, *Reading History Edition*. Sweets, E. and Grice, J. (2002) 'Hitting the right note: how useful is the music of African-Americans to historians?' in *Teaching History*, 108, *Performing History Edition*.
- 2 *The Murder of Emmett Till* performed 1962, unreleased; *Blowin' in the Wind*, on *The Freewheelin' Bob Dylan*, (Columbia, 1963); *Only a Pawn in their Game, The Lonesome Death of Hattie Carroll and The Times They Are A-Changin' on The Times They Are A-Changin'* (Columbia, 1964). Access to the songs and further resources can be found on Tony Fox's website <http://foggyruins.wordpress.com/>. I am extremely grateful to Tony on two counts. The idea of writing this piece first arose during a truly inspiring workshop on song and history teaching that Tony presented at the 2008 Leeds SHP Conference and thereafter his support during the writing process has been invaluable.
- 3 The recently revised National Curriculum (QCA 2007) designates 'evidence' as a key process and not a key concept. See <http://curriculum.qcda.gov.uk/key-stages-3-and-4/subjects/key-stage-3/history/programme-of-study/index.aspx>. In light of the work cited in note 4 below, there is an important debate to be had about the impact this distinction will have on the teaching of evidence and the learning of history.
- 4 The starting point is Lee, P. and Shemilt, D. (2003) 'A scaffold, not a cage: progression and progression models in history' in *Teaching History*, 113, *Creating Progress Edition*. Further development of these ideas can be found in Donovan, M.S. and Bransford, J.D. (eds) *How Students Learn History in the Classroom*, Washington DC: The National Academies Press. This set of studies has major contributions by Ashby, Lee and Shemilt. See also Wineburg, S. (2007) 'Unnatural and essential: the nature of historical thinking' in *Teaching History*, 129, *Disciplined Minds Edition*, which is a summary of his larger work (2001) *Historical Thinking and Other Unnatural Acts: Charting the Future of Teaching the Past*, Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.
- 5 Lee, P. and Shemilt, D. (2003) *op. cit.* This includes the six-level progression model for evidence as concept that underpins the activities in this article. For those with an interest in working in this area this progression model is indispensable. Unlike the National Curriculum attainment targets, Lee and Shemilt's model has the advantage of being empirically grounded.
- 6 Lee, P.J. (2005) 'Putting principles into practice: Understanding History' in Donovan, M. S. and Bransford, J.D. (eds) *op. cit.*, p.55; Lee, P. and Shemilt, D. (2003) *op. cit.*; Wineburg, S. (2007) *op. cit.*
- 7 This timeline of the American Civil Rights Movement (1962–63) can be found at www.ags.uci.edu/~skaufman/teaching/win2001ch4.htm
- 8 Lee, P. and Shemilt, D. (2003) *op. cit.*
- 9 Roberts, J (2005) *Bob Dylan: Voice of a Generation*, Minneapolis, MN: Lerner Publishing Group.
- 10 Marqusee, M. (2003) *Chimes of Freedom: The Politics of Bob Dylan's Art*, New York: The New Press, p.50.
- 11 Bob Dylan (1985) liner notes in *Biograph* (Columbia)
- 12 This report can be found at www.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,870451,00.html
- 13 Lee, P.J. (2005) *op. cit.*
- 14 Sam Cooke (1964) *A Change is Gonna Come, Ain't That Good News* (RCA Victor Records).
- 15 Chambers' periodic histories books 1–7 (1928), London: W. and R. Chambers Ltd.
- 16 Sylvester, D. (1994) 'Change and continuity in history teaching 1900–93' in H. Bourdillon (ed), *Teaching History*, London: Routledge.